

## Theories of Global Justice

Politics 4206f/9267a/Philosophy 9117a

Instructor: Richard Vernon, SSC 4216, [rv53239@gmail.com](mailto:rv53239@gmail.com)

Office hour: 10-11.30 Thursday, other times by appointment

A seminar on the most prominent views of global justice in recent political theory and on some major contested issues in that field.

Looking back at the history of political thought it is a truly remarkable fact that in the whole range of canonical writings, from Plato to Rawls, *justice* was taken to be something that ought to apply only to the relations among citizens of a state – not to the relations among citizens of different states. That assumption was not to be seriously challenged until the late 20<sup>th</sup> century, thanks to the pioneering work of Peter Singer and Charles Beitz (some of whose work we shall read). Since then the field has grown dramatically, and a one-term seminar can only be selective. For the first four weeks, after our initial meeting, we shall discuss four major general views: Singer's humanitarianism, the global "harm principle" approach, statism (the view that justice can apply only within states), and nationalism (the view that justice can apply only within nations). In each case, we read an exponent and a critic of the view. We then move on to discuss seven "applied" issue areas in which we can see these general views in collision with one another.

### Evaluation:

Mid-term exam (take-home): 15%, due October 12 (before 8 p.m.). The question will be set on Oct 6.

A major essay, worth 70%, due on December 9 (before midnight!). It is to be on one of our week's "applied" topics, drawing on the assigned readings plus the third "supplementary" reading listed. Other readings should not be used except incidentally. If you wish to vary this requirement, for example by writing on a topic that brings two of the weekly topics/readings together, that is entirely acceptable, but clear the idea with me first. 12 pages is suggested as a length for undergraduate essays, 15 pages for graduates. Any form of referencing is acceptable

The essay is subject to a late penalty of 2% per day including weekends.

Participation: 15%. **To be eligible** for this portion of the mark, you must submit an acceptable one-page (single-spaced) report on the main readings each week from Sept 13 to December 8, omitting the Oct 13 class. (If you miss one or two weeks that will be forgiven without question.) The report should briefly summarize the main points in each reading and conclude with a question that you think should be discussed: you may be called on to introduce it to the seminar. The report is to be emailed to me by 4 p.m. on the day before the class. **The mark itself** will be based on the helpfulness of your contributions to class discussions. Frequency itself is not a criterion, but if you let two weeks go by without contributing your participation mark is likely to be disappointing.

Participation for graduate students: as above, except that your weekly report should be 1.5 pages and should include some consideration of what the third weekly reading might contribute to the topic at hand. You may be given a week's notice to present a 10-minute commentary on what the third reading contributes.

**Readings** are available from Course Readings (UWO Library).

**Learning outcomes:** I hope that, at the end of the course, students will have a better understanding of the issues discussed than they had before!

Sept 8: Introduction to the course, and an initial discussion of global "vaccine justice" – please read a short paper by E.J. Emanuel et al., "An Ethical Framework for Global Vaccine Justice," *Science* 369/6509 (2020) 1309-12. (No written report needed, just bring questions/comments.)

Sept 15: Does distance make any difference?

Peter Singer, *One World*, 2nd edition, Yale University Press, 2004, chapter 5 – **pp 150-75 only**  
David Miller, "Reasonable Partiality Towards Compatriots," *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice* 8 (2005) 63-81.

Supplementary: Scott Wisor, "Against Shallow Ponds," *Journal of Global Ethics* 7 (2011) 19-32

Sept 22: A global harm principle?

Thomas Pogge, "'Assisting' the Global Poor?" in D. Chatterjee ed., *The Ethics of Assistance*, Cambridge University Press 2004, 260-88.  
Kok-Chor Tan, "Rights, Harm and Institutions," in A.M. Jaggar ed., *Thomas Pogge and his Critics*, Cambridge: Polity, 2010, 46-65.

Supplementary: Mathias Risse "Do We Owe the Global Poor Assistance or Rectification?" *Ethics & International Affairs* 19 (2005) 9-18.

Sept 29: Statism vs. global liberalism

Charles Beitz, *Political Theory and International Relations*, Princeton University Press 1999, **pp 125-69 only**.  
Thomas Nagel, "The Problem of Global Justice," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 33 (2005) 113-47.

Supplementary: Laura Valentini, "Coercion and (Global) Justice," *American Political Science Review* 105 (2011) 205-20

Oct 6: Cosmopolitanism vs Nationalism

David Miller, *On Nationality*, Oxford University Press 1995, chapter 3.

Robert Goodin, "What is So Special about Our Fellow Countrymen [sic]?" *Ethics* 98 (1988) 663-86

Supplementary: Gillian Brock, "What do we owe others as a matter of global justice and does national membership matter?" *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 11 (2008) 433-48

**October 12: Mid-term exam answer due**

Oct 13: A general discussion of the approaches discussed so far

Oct 20: Should borders be open?

Joseph Carens, *The Ethics of Immigration*, Oxford University Press 2013, chapter 11.

David Miller, *Strangers in Our Midst*, Harvard University Press 2016, chapter 4.

Supplementary: Javier S Hidalgo, "Freedom, Immigration and Adequate Options," *Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy* 187 (2015) 212-34

Oct 27: What's wrong with colonialism?

Lea Ypi, "What's wrong with colonialism?" *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 41 (2013) 158-91

Margaret Moore, "The Taking of Territory and the Wrongs of Colonialism," *Journal of Political Philosophy* 27 (2019) 87-106.

Supplementary: Laura Valentini, "On the Distinctive Procedural Wrong of Colonialism," *Philosophy & Public Affairs* 43 (2015) 321-341.

Nov 10: Justice and Intervention

C.A.J Coady, "War for Humanity: A Critique," in D.K. Chatterjee & D. Scheid eds., *Ethics and Foreign Intervention*, Cambridge University Press, 2003, 274-95.

Kok-Chor Tan, "The Duty to Protect," in T. Nardin and M. Williams eds., *Humanitarian Intervention*, New York University Press 2006, 84-116.

Supplementary: Ned Dobos, "A State to Call their Own," *Journal of Applied Philosophy* 27 (2010) 26-38.

Nov 17: What is exploitation?

Matt Zwolinski, "Sweatshops, Choice and Exploitation," *Business Ethics Quarterly* 17 (2007) 689-727.

Ruth Sample, *Exploitation*, Rowman & Littlefield 2003, chapter 1.

Supplementary: Robert Goodin, *Reasons for Welfare*, Princeton University Press 1998, chapter 5

Nov 24: Beyond the Nuremberg crimes?

Richard Vernon, "What is Crime Against Humanity?" *Journal of Political Philosophy* 10 (2002) 231-49.

David Blunt, *Global Poverty, Injustice and Resistance*, Cambridge University Press 2020, chapter 3.

Supplementary: Norman Geras, *Crimes Against Humanity*, Manchester University Press 2011, chapter 2.

Dec 1: Can whole societies be held accountable?

Toni Erskine, "Kicking Bodies and Damning Souls: The Danger of Harming 'Innocent' Citizens While Punishing 'Delinquent' States," *Ethics & International Affairs* 24 (2010) 261-85

Erin Kelly, "The Burdens of Collective Liability," in D.K. Chatterjee and D. Scheid eds., *Ethics and Foreign Intervention*, Cambridge University Press 2003, 118-39.

Supplementary: Avia Pasternak, *Responsible Citizens, Irresponsible States*, Oxford University Press 2021, chapter 7

Dec 8: What does climate justice require?

Peter Singer, *One World*, Yale University Press 2004, chapter 2.

Simon Caney, "Climate Change and the Duties of the Advantaged," *Critical Review of International Social & Political Philosophy* 13 (2010) 203-24

Supplementary: "On the Concept of Climate Debt: Its Moral and Political Value," *Critical Review of International Social & Political Philosophy* 15 (2012), 667-85

## **APPENDIX TO UNDERGRADUATE COURSE OUTLINES DEPARTMENT OF POLITICAL SCIENCE**

### **Prerequisite checking - the student's responsibility**

"Unless you have either the requisites for this course or written special permission from your Dean to enroll in it, you may be removed from this course and it will be deleted from your record. This decision may not be appealed. You will receive no adjustment to your fees in the event that you are dropped from a course for failing to have the necessary prerequisites."

### **Essay course requirements**

With the exception of 1000-level courses, most courses in the Department of Political Science are essay courses. Total written assignments (excluding examinations) will be at least 3,000 words in Politics 1020E, at least 5,000 words in a full course numbered 2000 or above, and at least 2,500 words in a half course numbered 2000 or above.

### **Use of Personal Response Systems ("Clickers")**

"Personal Response Systems ("clickers") may be used in some classes. If clickers are to be used in a class, it is the responsibility of the student to ensure that the device is activated and functional. Students must see their instructor if they have any concerns about whether the clicker is malfunctioning. Students must use only their own clicker. If clicker records are used to compute a portion of the course grade:

- the use of somebody else's clicker in class constitutes a scholastic offence,
- the possession of a clicker belonging to another student will be interpreted as an attempt to commit a scholastic offence."

**Security and Confidentiality of Student Work** (refer to current *Western Academic Calendar*  
<http://www.westerncalendar.uwo.ca/>)

**"Submitting or Returning Student Assignments, Tests and Exams** - All student assignments, tests and exams will be handled in a secure and confidential manner. Particularly in this respect, leaving student work unattended in public areas for pickup is not permitted."

### **Duplication of work**

Undergraduate students who submit similar assignments on closely related topics in two different courses must obtain the consent of both instructors prior to the submission of the assignment. If prior approval is not obtained, each instructor reserves the right not to accept the assignment.

### **Grade adjustments**

In order to ensure that comparable standards are applied in political science courses, the Department may require instructors to adjust final marks to conform to Departmental guidelines.

### **Academic Offences**

"Scholastic offences are taken seriously and students are directed to read the appropriate policy, specifically, the definition of what constitutes a Scholastic Offence, at the following Web site:  
[http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/academic\\_policies/appeals/scholastic\\_discipline\\_undergrad.pdf](http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/academic_policies/appeals/scholastic_discipline_undergrad.pdf)

### **Submission of Course Requirements**

ESSAYS, ASSIGNMENTS, TAKE-HOME EXAMS MUST BE SUBMITTED ACCORDING TO PROCEDURES SPECIFIED BY YOUR INSTRUCTOR (I.E., IN CLASS, DURING OFFICE HOURS, TA'S OFFICE HOURS) OR UNDER THE INSTRUCTOR'S OFFICE DOOR.

**THE MAIN OFFICE DOES NOT DATE-STAMP OR ACCEPT ANY OF THE ABOVE.**

### **Attendance Regulations for Examinations**

EXAMINATIONS/ATTENDANCE (Sen. Min. Feb.4/49, May 23/58, S.94, S.3538, S.3632, S.04-097) A student is entitled to be examined in courses in which registration is maintained, subject to the following limitations: 1) A student may be debarred from writing the final examination for failure to maintain satisfactory academic standing throughout the year. 2) Any student who, in the opinion of the instructor, is absent too frequently from class or laboratory periods in any course will be reported to the Dean of the Faculty offering the course (after due warning has been given). On the recommendation of the Department concerned, and with the permission of the Dean of that Faculty, the student will be debarred from taking the regular examination in the course. The Dean of the Faculty offering the course will communicate that decision to the Dean of the Faculty of registration.

## **Absences from Final Examinations**

If you miss the Final Exam, please contact the Academic Counselling office of your Faculty of Registration as soon as you are able to do so. They will assess your eligibility to write the Special Examination (the name given by the University to a makeup Final Exam).

You may also be eligible to write the Special Exam if you are in a "Multiple Exam Situation" (e.g., more than 2 exams in 23-hour period, more than 3 exams in a 47-hour period).

**Note:** Missed work can only be excused through one of the mechanisms above. Being asked not to attend an in-person course requirement due to potential COVID-19 symptoms is **not** sufficient on its own. Students should check the Western website to see what directives for Covid are to be followed. Western has been and will continue to follow directives established by the Middlesex-London Health Unit. That directive will state whether students should or should not come to campus/class and any other requirements (e.g., masks are mandatory). Please check on your own and do not email the instructor, the Department Undergraduate Advisor/Coordinator or the Faculty of Social Science Academic Counselling Office.

## **Accommodation and Accessibility**

### **Religious Accommodation**

When a course requirement conflicts with a religious holiday that requires an absence from the University or prohibits certain activities, students should request accommodation for their absence in writing at least two weeks prior to the holiday to the course instructor and/or the

Academic Counselling office of their Faculty of Registration. Please consult University's list of recognized religious holidays (updated annually) at

<https://multiculturalcalendar.com/ecal/index.php?s=c-univwo>.

## **Accommodation Policies**

Students with disabilities are encouraged to contact Accessible Education, which provides recommendations for accommodation based on medical documentation or psychological and cognitive testing. The policy on Academic Accommodation for Students with Disabilities can be found at:

[https://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/academic\\_policies/appeals/Academic Accommodation\\_disabilities.pdf](https://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/academic_policies/appeals/Academic_Accommodation_disabilities.pdf).

## **Academic Policies**

The website for Registrarial Services is <http://www.registrar.uwo.ca>.

In accordance with policy,

[https://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/policies\\_procedures/section1/mapp113.pdf](https://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/policies_procedures/section1/mapp113.pdf),

the centrally administered e-mail account provided to students will be considered the individual's official university e-mail address. It is the responsibility of the account holder to ensure that e-mail received from the University at their official university address is attended to in a timely manner.

During exams/tests/quizzes, no electronic devices (e.g. a phone, laptop, iPad) are allowed and must be powered down and stored out of reach.

**Scholastic offences** are taken seriously and students are directed to read the appropriate policy, specifically, the definition of what constitutes a Scholastic Offence, at the following Web site:

[http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/academic\\_policies/appeals/scholastic\\_discipline\\_undergrad.pdf](http://www.uwo.ca/univsec/pdf/academic_policies/appeals/scholastic_discipline_undergrad.pdf).

All required papers may be subject to submission for textual similarity review to the commercial plagiarism detection software under license to the University for the detection of plagiarism. All papers submitted for such checking will be included as source documents in the reference database for the purpose of detecting plagiarism of papers subsequently submitted to the system. Use of the service is subject to the licensing agreement, currently between The University of Western Ontario and Turnitin.com (<http://www.turnitin.com>).

Computer-marked multiple-choice tests and exams may be subject to submission for similarity review by software that will check for unusual coincidences in answer patterns that may indicate cheating.

If a course uses remote proctoring, please be advised that you are consenting to the use of this software and acknowledge that you will be required to provide **personal information** (including some biometric data) and the session will be **recorded**. Completion of a course with remote proctoring will require you to have a reliable internet connection and a device that meets the technical requirements for this service. More information about this remote proctoring service, including technical requirements, is available on Western's Remote Proctoring website at:

<https://remoteproctoring.uwo.ca>.

## Support Services

Please visit the Social Science Academic Counselling webpage for information on adding/dropping courses, academic considerations for absences, appeals, exam conflicts, and many other academic related matters: [Academic Counselling - Western University \(uwo.ca\)](https://www.uwo.ca/academic_counselling/)

Students who are in emotional/mental distress should refer to Mental Health@Western (<https://www.uwo.ca/health/>) for a complete list of options about how to obtain help.

Western is committed to reducing incidents of gender-based and sexual violence and providing compassionate support to anyone who has gone through these traumatic events. If you have experienced sexual or gender-based violence (either recently or in the past), you will find information about support services for survivors, including emergency contacts at

[https://www.uwo.ca/health/student\\_support/survivor\\_support/get-help.html](https://www.uwo.ca/health/student_support/survivor_support/get-help.html).

To connect with a case manager or set up an appointment, please contact [support@uwo.ca](mailto:support@uwo.ca).

Please contact the course instructor if you require lecture or printed material in an alternate format or if any other arrangements can make this course more accessible to you. You may also wish to contact Accessible Education at

[http://academicsupport.uwo.ca/accessible\\_education/index.html](http://academicsupport.uwo.ca/accessible_education/index.html)

if you have any questions regarding accommodations.

Learning-skills counsellors at the Learning Development and Success Centre (<https://learning.uwo.ca>) are ready to help you improve your learning skills. They offer presentations on strategies for improving time management, multiple-choice exam preparation/writing, textbook reading, and more. Individual support is offered throughout the Fall/Winter terms in the drop-in Learning Help Centre, and year-round through individual counselling.

Western University is committed to a thriving campus as we deliver our courses in the mixed model of both virtual and face-to-face formats. We encourage you to check out the Digital Student Experience website to manage your academics and well-being:

<https://www.uwo.ca/se/digital/>.

Additional student-run support services are offered by the USC, <https://westernusc.ca/services/>.



## Plagiarism:

Students must write their essays and assignments in their own words. Whenever students take an idea, or a passage from another author, they must acknowledge their debt both by using quotation marks where appropriate and by proper referencing such as footnotes or citations. Plagiarism is a major academic offence." (see Scholastic Offence Policy in the Western Academic Calendar).

**Plagiarism Checking:** "All required papers may be subject to submission for textual similarity review to the commercial plagiarism detection software under license to the University for the detection of plagiarism. All papers submitted for such checking will be included as source documents in the reference database for the purpose of detecting plagiarism of papers subsequently submitted to the system. Use of the service is subject to the licensing agreement, currently between The University of Western Ontario and Turnitin.com (<http://www.turnitin.com>)."

**Multiple-choice tests/exams:** "Computer-marked multiple-choice tests and/or exams may be subject to submission for similarity review by software that will check for unusual coincidences in answer patterns that may indicate cheating."

Note: Information excerpted and quoted above are Senate regulations from the Handbook of Scholarship and Academic Policy. [https://www.uwo.ca/univsec/academic\\_policies/index.html](https://www.uwo.ca/univsec/academic_policies/index.html)

### PLAGIARISM\*

In writing scholarly papers, you must keep firmly in mind the need to avoid plagiarism. Plagiarism is the unacknowledged borrowing of another writer's words or ideas. Different forms of writing require different types of acknowledgement. The following rules pertain to the acknowledgements necessary in academic papers.

#### **A. In using another writer's words, you must both place the words in quotation marks and acknowledge that the words are those of another writer.**

You are plagiarizing if you use a sequence of words, a sentence or a paragraph taken from other writers without acknowledging them to be theirs. Acknowledgement is indicated either by (1) mentioning the author and work from which the words are borrowed in the text of your paper; or by (2) placing a footnote number at the end of the quotation in your text, and including a correspondingly numbered footnote at the bottom of the page (or in a separate reference section at the end of your essay). This footnote should indicate author, title of the work, place and date of publication, and page number.

Method (2) given above is usually preferable for academic essays because it provides the reader with more information about your sources and leaves your text uncluttered with parenthetical and tangential references. In either case words taken from another author must be enclosed in quotation marks or set off from your text by single spacing and indentation in such a way that they cannot be mistaken for your own words. Note that you cannot avoid indicating quotation simply by changing a word or phrase in a sentence or paragraph which is not your own.

**B. In adopting other writers' ideas, you must acknowledge that they are theirs.**

You are plagiarizing if you adopt, summarize, or paraphrase other writers' trains of argument, ideas or sequences of ideas without acknowledging their authorship according to the method of acknowledgement given in 'A' above. Since the words are your own, they need not be enclosed in quotation marks. Be certain, however, that the words you use are entirely your own; where you must use words or phrases from your source, these should be enclosed in quotation marks, as in 'A' above.

Clearly, it is possible for you to formulate arguments or ideas independently of another writer who has expounded the same ideas, and whom you have not read. Where you got your ideas is the important consideration here. Do not be afraid to present an argument or idea without acknowledgement to another writer, if you have arrived at it entirely independently. Acknowledge it if you have derived it from a source outside your own thinking on the subject.

In short, use of acknowledgements and, when necessary, quotation marks is necessary to distinguish clearly between what is yours and what is not. Since the rules have been explained to you, if you fail to make this distinction your instructor very likely will do so for you, and they will be forced to regard your omission as intentional literary theft. Plagiarism is a serious offence which may result in a student's receiving an 'F' in a course or, in extreme cases in their suspension from the University.

\*Reprinted by permission of the Department of History

Adopted by the council of the Faculty of Social Science, October, 1970; approved by the Dept. of History August 13, 1991